APR 1 6 2003

DICIONSON R. DOSEVOISE

FAIR SHARE HOUSING CENTER 510 Park Boulevard Cherry Hill, New Jersey 08002 p. 856-665-5444

F: 856-663-8182 Attorneys for Third Party Defendants Fair Share Housing Center, Southern Burlington County At 150

Branch of NAACP, Camden County Branch of NAACP

By: Peter J. O'Connor, Esq. Kevin D. Walsh, Esq.

> UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

Newark Coalition for Low Income Housing, et al.

Plaintiffs,

Housing Authority of the City of Newark, et al. Defendants, Third-party

Plaintiffs.

Fair Share Housing Center, Southern Burlington County Branch of NAACP, Camden County Branch of NAACP, Camden City Taxpayers Association,

Third-party Defendants.

Hon. Dickinson R. Debevoise

Civil Action No. 89-1303 (DRD)

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND CONSENT ORDER



WHEREAS the following two cases brought by Fair Share Housing Center, Southern Burlington County Branch of NAACP, Camden County Branch of NAACP, and the Camden City Taxpayers Association are

pending before the New Jersey Superior Court, Appellate Division:

In re Adoption of the 2002 Low Income Housing Tax Credit Qualified
Allocation Plan, N.J.A.C. 5:80-33.1 to -33.40, by the New Jersey
Housing and Mortgage Finance Agency, Docket No.: A-10-02T2, and In
re Allocation of Federal Low Income Housing Tax Credits Under the
Urban, Hope VI, and Final Cycles Pursuant to the 2002 Low Income
Housing Tax Credit Qualified Allocation Plan, N.J.A.C. 5:80-33.1 to
-33.40, by the New Jersey Housing and Mortgage Finance Agency,
Docket No.: A-1551-02T2; and

WHEREAS A-10-02-T2 is a challenge to Low Income Housing Tax Credit regulations promulgated by the New Jersey Housing and Mortgage Finance Agency (IBMFA) and A-1551-02-T2 is a challenge to certain allocations of tax credits made by HMFA pursuant to those regulations; and

WHEREAS the third-party defendants are alleging in A-10-02-T2 and A-1551-02-T2 that HMFA through its administrative action has violated state and federal statutory and constitutional provisions by perpetuating and exacerbating racial and economic segregation in housing in New Jersey; and

WHEREAS JS Urban Renewal LP, a developer that has been selected to participate in the Housing Authority of the City of Newark's Hope VI Revitalization Program, was notified by HNFA in October 2002 that it had received an allocation of \$2,100,000 of 2002 tax credits and a reservation of \$999,985 of 2003 tax credits; and

WHEREAS on or about November 20, 2002, Fair Share Housing Center, Southern Burlington County Branch of NAACP, Camden County Branch of NAACP, and the Camden City Taxpayers Association filed an appeal of HMFA's allocation of tax credits to JS Urban Renewal LF and has appealed other allocations in A-1551-02-T2 to the New Jersey Superior Court, Appellate Division; and

WHEREAS the Newark Housing Authority of the City of Newark ("NHA") is the defendant in the subject litigation brought by the Newark Coalition for Low Income Housing that is pending before the Hon. Dickinson R. Debevoise, U.S.D.J.; and

WHEREAS the NHA was required by an Order and a Settlement
Agreement dated May 25, 1999 to apply to the United States
Department for Housing and Urban Development ("NUD") for a certain
Hope VI Revitalization grant; and

WHEREAS the NHA applied for and received HUD approval of the subject Hope VI Revitalization grant; and

WHEREAS the NHA on or about March 21, 2003 filed a verified Third-party complaint against Fair Share Housing Center, Southern Burlington County Branch of NAACP, Camden County Branch of NAACP, and the Camden City Taxpayers Association seeking to temporarily and permanently enjoin further state court proceedings by them involving tax credits allocated by IMPEA with regard to the redevelopment efforts that form part of the Hope VI Revitalization Program, including a request to enjoin the above-described State Court Appellate Division Tax Credit appeals as they affect or may

affect the implementation of the subject HOPE VI Revitalization grant; and

WHEREAS the NNA in its verified Third-Party Complaint sought to enforce the May 25, 1999 Order and Settlement Agreement referred to above against the third-party defendants by enjoining them from challenging tax credit allocations made to developers, such as JS Urban Renewal LP, with regard to all present and future tax credit allocations made in connection with the Mope VI Revitalization grant; and

WHEREAS following an appearance before Judge Debevoise on March 26, 2003 representatives of the Newark Housing Authority (Harold Lucas, Raymond A. Brown, Esq., Oliver Lofton, Esq., Karen Torian), the Newark Coalition for Low Income Housing (Jon Dubin, Esq.), and the third-party defendants (Feter J. O'Connor, Esq. and Kevin D. Walsh, Esq.) met with Special Master Gustav Henningburg, Mary Ann Russ (Abt Associates), Richard Evert, Esq. (HMFA), and others to discuss the possibility of settlement of the case brought against third-party defendants by the NBA; and

WHEREAS the third-party defendants maintain that the claim for injunctive relief in the third-party complaint is without merit, but consider it desirable to settle this action in the manner and upon the terms and conditions hereinafter set forth to avoid further expense, inconvenience, and the distraction of burdensome litigation; and WHEREAS on April 3, 2003 the Court held a hearing on the NHA's motion for a preliminary injunction and the feasibility of the implementation by the NHA of a Mobility Opportunity Program, dated March 31, 2003, prepared by the Court's expert, Mary Ann Russ, Abt Associates; and

WHEREAS the Court considered the April 2, 2003 memorandum to the Court and all counsel from Oliver Lofton, Deputy General Counsel for the NHA, objecting to the above Mobility Opportunity Program, the April 3, 2003 letter to the Court and all counsel from Jon C. Dubin, counsel for the plaintiffs, Newark Coalition for Low Income Housing, et al., testimony from Mary Ann Russ, Abt Associates, and witnesses presented by the NNA, and oral arguments of counsel for the NHA, Newark Coalition for Low Income Housing, et al., and the Third-party Defendants; and

WHEREAS representatives of the NHA and of Third-party

Defendants Fair Share Housing Center, Southern Burlington County

Branch of NAACP, Camden County Branch of NAACP, and the Camden City

Taxpayers Association have discussed the terms of a potential

settlement with Ms. Russ and Mr. Dubin and have shared with all

parties the terms of that proposed settlement; and

WHEREAS it appears that all parties have accepted the terms of the settlement, with certain time and cost limitations, as addressed below; and

NOW, THEREFORE, subject to final approval of the Court, the parties agree as follows:

- This Settlement Agreement is between the NHA and Thirdparty Defendants Fair Share Housing Center, Southern Burlington County Branch of NAACP, Camden County Branch of NAACP, and the Camden City Taxpayers Association.
- 2. The Third-Party Defendants shall withdraw with prejudice their Appeal pending as A-1551-02-T2 with regard to JS Urban Renewal LP's allocation of \$2,100,000 of 2002 tax credits and reservation of \$999,985 of 2003 tax credits or any substitution or exchange for these credits by HMFA in 2003 applicable to the same part of the Hope VI project and in the same amount. The Third-Party Defendants' consent to the withdrawal of the appeal with regard to that allocation and that withdrawal is without prejudice to their right to challenge future allocations and/or reservations of tax credits. Third-Party Defendants agree not to seek any retroactive relief in their appeal pending as A-10-02T2 insofar as such retroactive relief would affect JS Urban Renewal LP's allocation of \$2,100,000 2002 tax credits and the reservation of \$999,985 2003 tax credits, or any substitution or exchange for these credits by HMFA in 2003 applicable to the same part of the Hope VI project and in the same amount.
- A Stipulation of Dismissal by and between the Third-party Defendants and JS Urban Renewal, LF, a respondent in

appeal A-1551-0272 pending in the Appellate Division, shall be filed by the Third-Party Defendants in the Appellate Division within three days of the receipt of this order with copies provided to the parties herein and a copy filed with this Court. Third-party Defendants shall take all reasonable steps necessary to secure such dismissal, including, but not limited to, the filing of a motion for dismissal.

- 4. The Third-Party Complaint filed by the Newark Housing Authority against the Third-Party Defendants shall be and hereby is stayed by the Court, and the Third-Party Defendants are not required to file any responsive pleadings until further order of the court.
- 5. The NHA shall implement the Mobility Opportunity Program set forth in the attached document labeled Exhibit A, which is a four-page March 31, 2003 memorandum from Mary Ann Russ of Abt Associates, as limited in paragraph 6 below.
- 6. The NHA shall implement the Mobility Opportunity Program commencing 30 days from the date of this Order and until further order of the Court. The cost of implementation of the Mobility Opportunity Program shall be paid for by the NHA in an amount not to exceed \$40,000 for the first year and in an amount not to exceed \$35,000 for each year

- thereafter. The NHA may elect to exceed those amounts, but is not required to do so.
- 7. In the event that the cost for implementation of the Mobility Opportunity Program exceeds \$40,000 for the first year and \$35,000 for any year thereafter, the NHA shall have the right to petition the Court for relief from this Order. When computing the cost of implementation of the Mobility Opportunity Program, the NHA shall not include the costs of the satisfaction of other obligations it was required to satisfy prior to the execution of this Settlement Agreement and Consent Order, including, but not limited to, the pre-existing obligations related to the mobility program for former Stella Wright Homes tenants.
- 8. Abt Associates shall monitor the subject Enhanced Mobility Program and provide timely copies of its reports to the Newark Housing Authority, plaintiffs Newark Coalition for Low Income Housing and Third Party Defendants. The oversight and enforcement procedures addressed at pages 4-5 of the May 25, 1999 Settlement Agreement are incorporated herein by reference.
- 9. This Settlement Agreement is enforceable upon application to the Court and may be modified only with the written consent of the parties and/or by order of the Court. Plaintiffs Newark Coalition for Low Income Housing et al.

Third-party Defendants, and Third-party Plaintiff NHA

shall have standing to enforce this order.

Dated: Agril 14,2003

DICKINSON R. DEBEVOISE, U.S.S.D.J.

4/16/03.

CONSENT TO THE FORM AND CONTENT OF THIS ORDER

OLIVER LOFTON, ESQUIRE COUNSEL FOR NEWARK HOUSING AUTHORITY

. O'CONNOR, ESQUIRE COUNSEL FOR THIRD-PARTY

COUNSEL FOR THIRD-PARTY DEFENDANTS